

Court Documents

Daniel West et al

vs

Jehovah's Witnesses

1 2 3 4 5	Rudy Nolen, Esq., SBN 59808 Jonathan Saul, Esq., SBN 189271 William Brelsford, Esq., SBN 202839 NOLEN SAUL BRELSFORD 350 University Ave, Suite 280 Sacramento, California 95825 Telephone: (916) 564-9990 Facsimile: (916) 564-9991	
6	Attorneys for Plaintiffs DANIEL WEST, SHANE PENCE and AMBER PENCE	
7		
8	SUPERIOR COURT OF CALIFORNIA	
9	COUNTY OF YOLO	
10		
11	DANIEL WEST, SHANE PENCE, and) AMBER PENCE,)	CASE NO:
12	Plaintiffs,	Jury Trial Demanded
13	vs.)	Complaint for Damages: 1. Sexual Battery and Respondeat
14	WATCHTOWER BIBLE AND TRACT	Superior
15	SOCIETY OF NEW YORK, INC., WATCH) TOWER BIBLE AND SOCIETY OF)	 Common Law Negligence Negligent Appointment, Retention, and Supervision
16	PENNSYLVANIA, WATCHTOWER)	4. Gross Negligence - Wilful Misconduct
17	ENTERPRISES, L.L.C., WATCHTOWER) FOUNDATION, INC., WATCHTOWER)	Breach of Fiduciary Duty
18	ASSOCIATES, LTD., KINGDOM SUPPORT) SERVICES, INC., CHRISTIAN)	6. Negligence Per Se and Common Law Negligence:
19	CONGREGATION OF JEHOVAH'S) WITNESSES, RELIGIOUS ORDER OF)	Failure to Report Suspected Child Abuse
20	JEHOVAH'S WITNESSES, WOODLAND) CONGREGATION OF JEHOVAH'S)	7. Fraud, Fraudulent Concealment, and Conspiracy
21	WITNESSES, INC., QUINCY, CALIFORNIA) CONGREGATION OF JEHOVAH'S)	8. Ratification9. Alter Ego and Single
22	WITNESSES, INC., TIMOTHY SILVA, and) DOES 1 through 20, inclusive.	Business Enterprise 10. Negligent Usurpation of
23	Defendants.	Investigatory Function 11. Violation of Penal Code § 182
24		12. Violation of Penal Code § 32
25	<u> </u>	
26	PLAINTIFFS' ORIGINAL COMPLAINT	
27	COME NOW DANIEL WEST, SHANE PENCE and AMBER PENCE, Plaintiffs in the	
21	COME TO IT DESCRIBE THE TELEVISION AND THE PROOF I MINISTER IN THE	

above entitled cause, and file this their Original Complaint, and allege as follows:

I.

PARTIES

- 1. Plaintiff DANIEL WEST, born July 30, 1977, is and at all times mentioned herein, was a resident of Yolo County, California. At all material times, Plaintiff was also a child entrusted to the Watchtower Defendants' care within the State of California. As a child, Plaintiff was sexually abused by a Ministerial Servant appointed by the Watchtower Defendants' organization within the State of California.
- 2. Plaintiff SHANE PENCE, born January 30, 1985, is and at all times mentioned herein, was a resident of Yolo County, California. At all material times, Plaintiff was also a child entrusted to the Watchtower Defendants' care within the State of California. As a child, Plaintiff was sexually abused by Ministerial Servant appointed by the Watchtower Defendants' organization within the State of California.
- 3. Plaintiff AMBER PENCE, born October 4, 1980, is and at all times mentioned herein, was a resident of Yolo County, California. At all material times, Plaintiff was also a child entrusted to the Watchtower Defendants' care within the State of California. As a child, Plaintiff was sexually abused by a Ministerial Servant appointed by the Watchtower Defendants' organization within the State of California.
- 4. Defendant WATCHTOWER BIBLE AND TRACT SOCIETY OF NEW YORK, INC., a corporation organized and existing under the laws of the State of New York, has conducted business within the State of California through its agents and alter egos and may be served with process through its California agent for service of process, James M. McCabe, 4817 Santa Monica Avenue, San Diego, CA 92107.
- 5. Defendant WATCHTOWER BIBLE AND TRACT SOCIETY OF PENNSYLVANIA, a corporation organized and existing under the laws of the State of Pennsylvania, has conducted business within the State of California through its agents and alter egos and may be served with process at its offices located at 1630 Spring Run Road Extension, Coraopolis, Pennsylvania 15108.

- 6. Defendant WATCHTOWER ENTERPRISES, INC., a limited liability company organized and existing under the laws of the State of New York, has conducted business within the State of California through its agents and alter egos and may be served with process at its offices located at 25 Columbia Heights, Brooklyn, New York 11201
- 7. Defendant WATCHTOWER FOUNDATION, INC., a corporation organized and existing under the laws of the State of New York, has conducted business within the State of California through its agents and alter egos and may be served with process at its offices located at 25 Columbia Heights, Brooklyn, New York 11201
- 8. Defendant WATCHTOWER ASSOCIATES, LTD., a corporation organized and existing under the laws of the State of New York, has conducted business within the State of California through its agents and alter egos and may be served with process at its offices located at 147 Holiday Drive, Westbury, New York 11797.
- 9. Defendant KINGDOM SUPPORT SERVICES, INC., a corporation organized and existing under the laws of the State of New York, has conducted business within the State of California through its agents and alter egos and may be served with process at its offices located at 98 Montague Street, Brooklyn, New York 11201.
- 10. Defendant CHRISTIAN CONGREGATION OF JEHOVAH'S WITNESSES, a corporation organized and existing under the laws of the State of New York, has conducted business within the State of California through its agents and alter egos and may be served with process at its offices located at 100 Watchtower Drive, Patterson, New York 12563-9204
- 11. Defendant RELIGIOUS ORDER OF JEHOVAH'S WITNESSES, a corporation organized and existing under the laws of the State of New York, has conducted business within the State of California through its agents and alter egos and may be served with process at its offices located at 25 Columbia Heights, Brooklyn, New York 11201-2483.
- 12. Defendant WOODLAND CONGREGATION OF JEHOVAH'S WITNESSES, INC. is a corporation organized and existing under the laws of the State of California, and may be served with process through its agent for service of process, ALEX VASQUEZ, 221 Teton Place, Woodland, CA 95695-5829.

- 13. Defendant QUINCY, CALIFORNIA, CONGREGATION OF JEHOVAH'S WITNESSES, INC., is a corporation organized and existing under the laws of the State of California and may be served with process through its agent for service of process, Robert Bowen, 140 Cottonwood Court, Quincy, California 95971.
- 14. Defendant TIMOTHY SILVA resides and may be served with process at 824 3rd Street, Woodland, California 75695-4502.
- 15. Plaintiffs allege on information and belief that at all relevant times, defendants DOES 1 through 20 inclusive, are individuals and/or business or corporate entities incorporated in and/or doing business in California.
- 16. The true names and capacities, whether individual, corporate, associate, or otherwise, of defendants DOES 1 through 20, inclusive, are unknown to Plaintiffs who therefore sues such defendants by such fictitious names, and will amend the complaint to show the true names and capacities of each DOE defendant when ascertained. Plaintiffs allege on information and belief that each defendant designated as a DOE is legally responsible in some manner for the events, happenings, and/or tortuous, and unlawful conduct that caused the injuries and damages alleged in this complaint.
- 17. The Defendant entities are collectively referred to herein as the "WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS" and each is the alter ego of each other and operates as a single business enterprise. Each of the WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS was acting within the scope and course of his or its authority as an agent, servant, and/or alter ego of the other and each of them engaged in, joined in and conspired with the other wrongdoers in carrying out the unlawful activities alleged in this complaint.

II.

JURISDICTION AND VENUE

- 18. Each Plaintiff has been damaged in an amount exceeding the minimum jurisdictional requirements of this Court.
- 19. Venue is proper in Yolo County, California because Defendant WOODLAND CONGREGATION OF JEHOVAH'S WITNESSES, INC. has its principal place of business in Yolo

County and because some of the acts or omissions that give rise to Plaintiffs' claims occurred in Yolo County, California.

III.

FACTS COMMON TO ALL CAUSES OF ACTION

- 20. In the past, certain Elders, Ministerial Servants, Pioneers, Male Publishers, Agents, volunteers and other leaders and representatives of the WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS' organization, including Defendant TIMOTHY SILVA, have used their positions of authority within the WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS' organization to sexually abuse minors, including Plaintiffs. The WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS were notified of the abuse of these minors by their elders and other leaders, including Defendant TIMOTHY SILVA, but failed to take reasonable steps to ensure the safety of Plaintiffs and other minor children entrusted to their care and to prevent future acts of molestation. This suit seeks compensation for Plaintiffs, victims of this sexual abuse.
- 21. All paragraphs of this Complaint are based on information and belief, except for those allegations, which pertain to the Plaintiffs and their counsel. Plaintiffs' information and belief are based upon, inter alia, the investigation conducted to date by Plaintiffs and their counsel. Each allegation in this Complaint either has, or is likely to have, evidentiary support upon further investigation and discovery.
- 22. The WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS' organization is a hierarchical structure in which the GOVERNING BODY, which is a small group of men who operate out of various entities within the hierarchical structure, sits at the top of a chain of command that extends over each individual and Defendant entity in the organization including its worldwide operations. These individuals and entities act as agents, servants and alter egos of each other. Authority for actions by the organization or its members is derived from the GOVERNING BODY.
- 23. All of the Defendants are the agents and servants of each other and are vicariously liable for each other's acts. The WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS are so organized and controlled and their affairs are so conducted that they are alter egos of each other and operate as a single business enterprise.
 - 24. Through its hierarchical structure, the WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS assume

27

28

responsibility for the development, protection and discipline of its membership, especially the children of members. All male members, whether Elders, Ministerial Servants, Pioneers and/or Publishers, are appointed and empowered by the GOVERNING BODY to carry out this responsibility.

- 25. To further their goals, the WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS authorize male members to develop relationships of trust with women, children and families and to assume a role of counselor and advocate for any problems that might arise, including claims of child abuse. It is the responsibility of the Elders and those higher up in the chain of command, including the GOVERNING BODY, to decide if abuse has occurred and how it should be handled.
- Despite knowledge of a problem with sexual abuse of minors by leaders in the 26. WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS' organization, the WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS acted with willful indifference and/or reckless and/or intentional disregard for the interest and safety of the children entrusted to their care. Rather than implement measures to redress and prevent the sexual molestation of these children, the WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS engaged in a systematic pattern and practice of suppression of information to cover-up and hide incidents of child molestation from law enforcement and their membership in order to protect those within the WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS' organization who committed acts of sexual molestation against children. The WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS have likewise engaged in the routine practice of maintaining secret archival files regarding sexual abuse by Elders, Ministerial Servants, Pioneers, Male Publishers and other leaders in the organization. The existence of these files and the contents thereof were not disclosed to or made available to law enforcement authorities or others to investigate the crimes of these leaders in the WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS' organization. The WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS furthered this conspiracy of concealment by, among other things, failing to properly report complaints of sexual misconduct to law enforcement authorities and failing to remove molesting leaders or prevent their access to children. Molesting leaders were allowed to remain as leaders in good standing in the organization and were allowed continued frequent and unsupervised access to children in the organization. At all material times, the WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS prohibited the victim and/or accuser from warning others or speaking about the

27

28

matter to anyone under penalty of discipline. Victim/accusers were not permitted to report suspected abuse to outside authorities or to other Publishers within the organization, despite secular laws and duties regarding the reporting of sexual abuse. Violation of this policy would lead to severe sanctions. The WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS also failed to provide Plaintiffs and their families with any notice or warning regarding the past misconduct of, and abuse by, leaders in the organization, including Timothy Silva. The WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS represented to Plaintiffs, members and the public that these leaders were fit to lead, when in fact they were predator pedophiles. The WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS knew or had reason to know that these leader molesters would continue to sexually molest children, using their leadership positions to gain access and control over their victims.

27. In 1985 Defendant TIMOTHY SILVA was a male leader in good standing with the WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS through Defendant WOODLAND CONGREGATION OF JEHOVAH'S WITNESSES, INC. As a male leader, the WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS vested Defendant TIMOTHY SILVA with authority over women and children in the local congregation. By 1987, if not before, the WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS received non-confidential notice that Defendant TIMOTHY SILVA had used his position of authority in the WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS' organization to sexually molest an adolescent boy under the care of WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS' organization. Despite this notice, the WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS took no action to report the abuse to authorities, discipline their agent Defendant TIMOTHY SILVA, or warn other members of the organization of the abuse by Defendant TIMOTHY SILVA. Instead, the WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS appointed Defendant TIMOTHY SILVA to a higher position of authority within the local congregation. As part of this appointment, the WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS assigned and authorized their agent Defendant TIMOTHY SILVA to lead adolescent book studies. These studies are required by the WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS for adolescents under the care of the WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS' organization. This sexual predator used his appointed position of leadership with authority over children to gain access to and abuse those children.

- 28. Beginning in 1990, Defendant TIMOTHY SILVA used his position of authority, as an agent of the WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS, to gain access to and sexually abuse Plaintiff AMBER PENCE who was under the care of the WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS' organization through Defendant WOODLAND CONGREGATION OF JEHOVAH'S WITNESSES, INC. She was thirteen (13) years old when the abuse began.
- 29. In 1991, the WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS, with knowledge that Defendant TIMOTHY SILVA was using his position as a teacher of children to abuse children in this care, entrusted Plaintiff DANIEL WEST, then thirteen (13) years old, to the supervision and tutelage of Defendant TIMOTHY SILVA for book and Bible studies. Beginning in 1991 and continuing through 1993, Defendant TIMOTHY SILVA used his position of trust and authority in the WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS' organization to gain access to and sexually abuse Plaintiff, DANIEL WEST.
- 30. The WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS were notified of the abuse of Plaintiff DANIEL WEST. In response, the WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS did not notify authorities or take any steps to hold their agent Defendant TIMOTHY SILVA accountable. Nor did they provide any assistance to Plaintiff DANIEL WEST in dealing with the trauma. Instead, the WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS accused Plaintiff DANIEL WEST of participating in homosexual activity, thereby exacerbating his trauma. Despite the repeated notice of Defendant TIMOTHY SILVA'S use of his position within the WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS' organization to gain access to, and control over, his victims, the WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS took no action to warn other members of the organization that their agent, who was in a position of supervising and teaching children, was a dangerous sexual predator. Defendant TIMOTHY SILVA continued to use his position to abuse adolescent children in the WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS' organization.
- 31. From approximately 1992 1997, Defendant TIMOTHY SILVA committed continued and repeated sexual battery upon Plaintiff SHANE PENCE who was seven (7) years old when the abuse began. Plaintiff SHANE PENCE was under the care of WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS at the time. His mother reported the abuse to the WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS in a non-confidential communication. In response, the WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS met with Plaintiff SHANE PENCE and his father and told them that they would do what was necessary to

address the problem. Plaintiff SHANE PENCE and his family were specifically told not to take any action on their own. Despite their representations, the WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS did not report the abuse to authorities and took no steps to address it.

- 32. In 1996 or 1997, the WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS received further notice that their agent, Defendant TIMOTHY SILVA was continuing to use his position of authority with the WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS to obtain access to adolescent victims. At that time, DANIEL WEST met with the WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS' agents, the Elders of Defendant WOODLAND CONGREGATION OF JEHOVAH'S WITNESSES and discussed the abuse by Defendant TIMOTHY SILVA. Rather than taking any steps to report Defendant TIMOTHY SILVA to authorities, discipline their agent Defendant TIMOTHY SILVA or otherwise act on behalf of the victims, the WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS accused DANIEL WEST of engaging in homosexual activity.
- 33. On September 4, 2001, Defendant TIMOTHY SILVA pled guilty to the sexual abuse of Plaintiff SHANE PENCE, a minor under the age of 14 years.
- known that their agent, Defendant TIMOTHY SILVA was using his leadership position to sexually molest and physically abuse adolescents within their organization. Nevertheless, the WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS elevated their agent, Defendant TIMOTHY SILVA to a position of increased authority and affirmatively entrusted him with the welfare of numerous adolescents as a teacher with authority over them. The WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS' agent, Defendant TIMOTHY SILVA used this position to gain access to and sexually abuse the children entrusted to his care. The WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS refused to notify anyone that their agent, Defendant TIMOTHY SILVA was using his position to gain access to and sexually abuse adolescents under his care. They further failed to take any steps to protect these young victims from his abuse. Instead, they knowingly concealed this information from Plaintiffs and others. The WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS also aided, abetted and ratified the abuse by disciplining the victims who reported the abuse to the WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS, allowing Defendant TIMOTHY SILVA to exercise increased power over them and to further exacerbate the injuries they had suffered.

- 35. Plaintiffs' and their families sought the advice and protection of the WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS and told them about the abuses perpetrated by their agent, Defendant TIMOTHY SILVA. The WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS assumed the role of advocate and counselor to Plaintiffs and their families and instructed them to keep the abuse matters within the WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS' organization and not to disclose the abuse to any other members or outside authorities. They even punished these victims. Thus, the WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS aided and abetted the perpetrator and ratified his conduct, causing further damage to Plaintiffs.
- 36. The WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS did not report the abuse to law enforcement authorities nor did they warn any other members of the WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS' organization that they had appointed a dangerous sexual predator to teach and supervise their children. The WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS did not act to help Plaintiffs or their families deal with the trauma and actively prevented them from obtaining help from trained professionals and other available sources. They also took no steps to discipline or otherwise hold their agent, Defendant TIMOTHY SILVA accountable for his conduct or to assist him in addressing his propensities.
- 37. Defendant TIMOTHY SILVA used the authority of his position in the WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS' organization to sexually abuse Plaintiffs. The WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS directly and vicariously caused foreseeable harm to Plaintiffs by, among other things:
 - a. aiding, abetting and ratifying the abuse of children by their agents;
 - blaming, humiliating, sanctioning and/or disciplining victims/accusers of sexual abuse instead of the perpetrators;
 - c. negligently failing to report such sexual abuse, including the abuse by Defendant TIMOTHY SILVA, to law enforcement and governmental child welfare agencies and requiring that members not make such reports;
 - negligently failing to warn Plaintiffs, their families, and others of the risk that their agent Defendant TIMOTHY SILVA, might abuse them, after the WATCHTOWER

DEFENDANTS knew or should have known of Defendant TIMOTHY SILVA'S propensities to use his position of leadership to engage in acts of sexual abuse of children;

- e. negligently failing to train its Elders, Ministerial Servants, Overseers and other appointed leaders to identify, investigate, prevent and respond to or report child abuse;
- f. negligently failing to adopt adequate policies and procedures for the protection of children and others in their care and/or to implement and comply with such procedures that did exist;
- g. failing to properly investigate matters brought to the WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS' attention involving child sexual abuse and/or suspicions of child sexual abuse of children under their care;
- h. negligently allowing their agent, Defendant TIMOTHY SILVA to move between congregations as a leader in good standing after the WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS knew or should have known of his propensities to use his position of leadership to engage in acts of sexual abuse of children;
- negligently failing to provide child abuse victims and their families with any assistance in coping with the trauma of abuse and preventing Plaintiffs and their families from reporting the abuse to outside authorities and obtaining outside help to deal with the trauma of abuse;
- j. concealing from Plaintiffs and their families that the WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS had information that their agent, Defendant TIMOTHY SILVA was using his position and authority to gain access to and abuse young children;
- k. negligently failing to undertake a sexual offender evaluation, provide sexual offender treatment and/or obtain psychiatric evaluation and treatment of Defendant TIMOTHY SILVA after they knew or should have known of his propensities to use his position of leadership to engage in acts of sexual abuse;

•

negligently failing to properly supervise Defendant TIMOTHY SILVA as a teacher
in the organization or to monitor his activities after they knew or should have known
of his propensities to use his position of leadership to engage in acts of sexual abuse.

FIRST CAUSE OF ACTION SEXUAL BATTERY and RESPONDEAT SUPERIOR

- 38. Plaintiffs incorporate herein by this reference and re-allege paragraphs 1 through 37 of this Complaint as if fully set forth herein.
- 39. Plaintiffs allege that for a number of years, beginning in 1990, as an agent and alter ego of the WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS, Defendant TIMOTHY SILVA repeatedly used his position in the WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS' organization to gain access to Plaintiffs and to engage in un-permitted, harmful, and offensive sexual contact upon the bodies of Plaintiffs and each of them, as described herein, without Plaintiffs' consent, committing sexual abuse upon the persons of the Plaintiffs in the State of California in violation of Code of Civil Procedure 340.1.
- 40. Plaintiffs further allege each of the WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS was in the chain of command and acted pursuant to the authority granted to them as agents and alter ego of the GOVERNING BODY and each other, utilized such leadership and authority to carry out and/or aid, abet and ratify the sexual abuse of Plaintiffs. In such capacity, the WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS are liable for the sexual abuse of Plaintiffs under the legal theory of *respondeat superior*.
- 41. As a legal result of Defendants' conduct as described hereinabove, Plaintiffs have suffered, and will continue to suffer great pain of mind, body, shock, emotional distress, physical manifestations of emotional distress, embarrassment, loss of self-esteem, disgrace, humiliation, and loss of enjoyment of life. Further, Plaintiffs were prevented and will continue to be prevented from performing daily activities and obtaining the full enjoyment of life. Each Plaintiff has sustained loss of earnings and earning capacity. Each Plaintiff has incurred and will incur expenses for medical and psychological treatment, therapy, and counseling.

SECOND CAUSE OF ACTION COMMON-LAW NEGLIGENCE

- 42. Plaintiffs incorporate herein by this reference and re-allege paragraphs 1 through 41 of this Complaint as if fully set forth herein.
- 43. Plaintiffs allege that at all times herein mentioned, WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS assumed a duty to protect Plaintiffs from sexual predators within the WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS' organization. The WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS further knew or should have known that Plaintiffs were at risk of foreseeable harm by their agent, Defendant TIMOTHY SILVA, but failed to act to protect them from said harm. The WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS breached their duty to Plaintiffs, thereby causing great harm to Plaintiffs.
- 44. As a legal result of Defendants' conduct as described hereinabove, Plaintiffs have suffered, and will continue to suffer great pain of mind, body, shock, emotional distress, physical manifestations of emotional distress, embarrassment, loss of self-esteem, disgrace, humiliation, and loss of enjoyment of life. Further, Plaintiffs were prevented and will continue to be prevented from performing daily activities and obtaining the full enjoyment of life. Each Plaintiff has sustained loss of earnings and earning capacity. Each Plaintiff has incurred and will incur expenses for medical and psychological treatment, therapy, and counseling.

THIRD CAUSE OF ACTION NEGLIGENT APPOINTMENT, RETENTION AND SUPERVISION

- 45. Plaintiffs incorporate herein by this reference and re-allege paragraphs 1 through 44 of this Complaint as if fully set forth herein.
- 46. Plaintiffs allege that at all times herein mentioned, the WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS knew or should have known of their agent, Defendant TIMOTHY SILVA's, propensities to use his position as a teacher of children entrusted to his care to engage in acts of sexual abuse against children under the care of the WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS. The WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS failed to adequately investigate, evaluate, and otherwise research the background of their agent, Defendant TIMOTHY SILVA, prior to their appointing him to leadershop positions and entrusting children to his care.
- 47. Plaintiffs further allege that after Defendant TIMOTHY SILVA was retained by WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS acting on behalf of and under the supervision of the

WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS, WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS failed to adequately investigate, evaluate and otherwise monitor the conduct of their agent, Defendant TIMOTHY SILVA, during his interactions with children entrusted by WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS to his care, thereby also failing to adequately supervise, and discipline the conduct Defendant TIMOTHY SILVA.

- 48. Plaintiff's further allege that WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS failed to provide adequate warning to Plaintiffs and their families of their agents' dangerous propensities and unfitness to lead.
- 49. Plaintiffs further allege the WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS negligently investigated, appointed, retained and supervised Defendant TIMOTHY SILVA in the organization at a time when they knew or should have known of his propensities to use his appointed position to engage in acts of sexual abuse against Plaintiffs and other young children under the WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS' care.
- 50. As a legal result of Defendants' conduct as described hereinabove, Plaintiffs have suffered, and will continue to suffer great pain of mind, body, shock, emotional distress, physical manifestations of emotional distress, embarrassment, loss of self-esteem, disgrace, humiliation, and loss of enjoyment of life. Further, Plaintiffs were prevented and will continue to be prevented from performing daily activities and obtaining the full enjoyment of life. Each Plaintiff has sustained loss of earnings and earning capacity. Each Plaintiff has incurred and will incur expenses for medical and psychological treatment, therapy, and counseling.

FOURTH CAUSE OF ACTION GROSS NEGLIGENCE/WILFUL MISCONDUCT

- 51. Plaintiffs incorporate herein by this reference and re-allege paragraphs 1 through 50 of this Complaint as if fully set forth herein.
- 52. Plaintiffs allege the behavior of the WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS as described hereinabove demonstrates a conscious indifference to the safety and welfare of Plaintiffs, in that WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS knew or should have known of the dangerous propensities of their agent, Defendant TIMOTHY SILVA, yet failed to act to protect the health, safety and welfare

of children in the custody and care of WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS, thereby allowing Plaintiffs to be sexually abused, which could have been prevented but for WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS' wilful misconduct and gross negligence in failing to implement safeguards to protect Plaintiffs, in violation of WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS' duty to protect the children entrusted to Defendant TIMOTHY SILVA'S care and custody.

- 53. Plaintiffs further allege that WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS' actions, constituting wilful misconduct and gross negligence described hereinabove, caused significant mental, emotional, and physical injuries as a result of the acts of sexual abuse described hereinabove.
- 54. As a legal result of Defendants' conduct as described hereinabove, Plaintiffs have suffered, and will continue to suffer great pain of mind, body, shock, emotional distress, physical manifestations of emotional distress, embarrassment, loss of self-esteem, disgrace, humiliation, and loss of enjoyment of life. Further, Plaintiffs were prevented and will continue to be prevented from performing daily activities and obtaining the full enjoyment of life. Each Plaintiff has sustained loss of earnings and earning capacity. Each Plaintiff has incurred and will incur expenses for medical and psychological treatment, therapy, and counseling.

FIFTH CAUSE OF ACTION BREACH OF FIDUCIARY DUTY

- 55. Plaintiffs incorporate herein by this reference and re-allege paragraphs 1 through 54 of this Complaint as if fully set forth herein.
- 56. Plaintiffs allege that by holding Defendant TIMOTHY SILVA out as a qualified leader in the WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS' organization, and by undertaking the religious instruction and spiritual and emotional counseling of Plaintiffs, the WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS, created a fiduciary relationship with Plaintiffs. The WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS placed themselves in a position of trust and confidence with Plaintiffs and that such relationship imposed on the WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS a duty to act in Plaintiffs' best interests, and to protect Plaintiffs' best interests.
- 57. Plaintiffs further allege that because of this special relationship with the WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS, Plaintiffs and their families placed their trust and confidence

in the WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS that they would not allow harm to Plaintiffs or fail to warn Plaintiffs of potential harm. Further, Plaintiffs and their families placed their trust and confidence in the WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS that they would protect Plaintiffs from harm.

- 58. The above conduct, either independently or in conjunction with each other, constitutes a breach of the fiduciary duty owed to Plaintiffs by WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS.
- 59. As a legal result of Defendants' conduct as described hereinabove, Plaintiffs have suffered, and will continue to suffer great pain of mind, body, shock, emotional distress, physical manifestations of emotional distress, embarrassment, loss of self-esteem, disgrace, humiliation, and loss of enjoyment of life. Further, Plaintiffs were prevented and will continue to be prevented from performing daily activities and obtaining the full enjoyment of life. Each Plaintiff has sustained loss of earnings and earning capacity. Each Plaintiff has incurred and will incur expenses for medical and psychological treatment, therapy, and counseling.

SIXTH CAUSE OF ACTION NEGLIGENCE PER SE and COMMON-LAW NEGLIGENCE FAILURE TO REPORT SUSPECTED CHILD ABUSE

- 60. Plaintiffs incorporate herein by this reference and re-allege paragraphs 1 through 59 of this Complaint as if fully set forth herein.
- 61. Plaintiffs allege that the WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS had a duty, under California Child Abuse and Neglect Reporting Act, California Penal Code § 11164, et. seq., (and predecessor provisions) and the common-laws, to report the abuse or suspected abuse of children.
- enforcement the abusive and illegal acts of their agent, Defendant TIMOTHY SILVA, both prior to and after the abuse inflicted on Plaintiffs. By failing to report the actions Defendant TIMOTHY SILVA, the WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS violated the California Child Abuse and Neglect Reporting Act, which is intended to safeguard and enhance the welfare of abused children. Plaintiffs were members of the class of persons the California Child Abuse and Neglect Reporting Act was designed to protect and each was injured as a result of the WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS' violation of the statutes. Such violation constitutes negligence *per se*.

64. As a legal result of the WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS' failure to report the illegal conduct of their agent, Defendant TIMOTHY SILVA, to law enforcement, Plaintiffs were deprived of the benefits provided by the State of California and other trained officials that could have decreased further harm to Plaintiffs and prevented further abuse. Plaintiffs have suffered, and will continue to suffer great pain of mind, body, shock, emotional distress, physical manifestations of emotional distress, embarrassment, loss of self-esteem, disgrace, humiliation, and loss of enjoyment of life. Further, Plaintiffs were prevented and will continue to be prevented from performing daily activities and obtaining the full enjoyment of life. Each Plaintiff has sustained loss of earnings and earning capacity. Each Plaintiff has incurred and will incur expenses for medical and psychological treatment, therapy, and counseling.

SEVENTH CAUSE OF ACTION FRAUD, FRAUDULENT CONCEALMENT AND CONSPIRACY

- 65. Plaintiffs incorporate herein by this reference and re-allege paragraphs 1 through 64 of this Complaint as if fully set forth herein.
- 66. Plaintiffs allege that after receiving reports that their agent, Defendant TIMOTHY SILVA, was using his position of authority in the organization to abuse adolescents under their care, the WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS willfully and intentionally kept the information from

Plaintiffs, other victims similarly situated, and the community-at-large. The WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS intentionally misrepresented to Plaintiffs and their families that their agent, Defendant TIMOTHY SILVA was a leader in good standing with authority to instruct Plaintiffs in spiritual, ethical and moral matters and that he was to be obeyed. The WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS further intentionally misrepresented that they would act in Plaintiffs' best interest. The WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS failed to disclose that they knew of their agents', Defendant TIMOTHY SILVA'S, propensities to use his leadership position to sexually abuse Plaintiffs and others and that they were doing nothing to protect Plaintiffs. Plaintiffs did not know of the falsity of Defendants' representations, were entitled to rely upon them and did in fact rely upon them causing each of them serious injury and harm.

- 67. Plaintiffs further allege that by holding out Defendant TIMOTHY SILVA as a leader, qualified to provide religious instruction and counsel, and by undertaking the religious instruction and spiritual and emotional counseling and training of Plaintiffs, and by accepting, through their agents, Defendant TIMOTHY SILVA and other Elders and leaders, the control and responsibility of the Plaintiffs as minors, the WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS and each of them entered into a fiduciary relationship with the minor plaintiffs.
- 68. Plaintiffs further allege that as fiduciaries to Plaintiffs, the WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS, and each of them, had the duty to obtain and disclose information relating to sexual misconduct by their agent, Defendant TIMOTHY SILVA. The WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS failed to disclose and later conspired to conceal such information from Plaintiffs.
- 69. The WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS, in concert with each other and with the intent to conceal and defraud, conspired whereby they would misrepresent, conceal or fail to disclose information relating to the sexual misconduct of their agents, Defendant TIMOTHY SILVA. By concealing such information, the WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS and each of them committed at least one act in furtherance of the conspiracy.
- 70. As a legal result of Defendants' conduct as described hereinabove, Plaintiffs have suffered, and will continue to suffer great pain of mind, body, shock, emotional distress, physical manifestations of emotional distress, embarrassment, loss of self-esteem, disgrace, humiliation, and

loss of enjoyment of life. Further, Plaintiffs were prevented and will continue to be prevented from performing daily activities and obtaining the full enjoyment of life. Each Plaintiff has sustained loss of earnings and earning capacity. Each Plaintiff has incurred and will incur expenses for medical and psychological treatment, therapy, and counseling.

EIGHTH CAUSE OF ACTION RATIFICATION

- 71. Plaintiffs incorporate herein by this reference and re-allege paragraphs 1 through 70 of this Complaint as if fully set forth herein.
- 72. Plaintiffs allege that upon learning that their agent, Defendant TIMOTHY SILVA had used his position of authority to sexually abuse Plaintiffs and others, the WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS failed to take any steps to hold their agent, Defendant TIMOTHY SILVA accountable for his actions and continued to maintain that Defendant TIMOTHY SILVA was authorized and qualified to teach and supervise children. The WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS thereby ratified their agent, Defendant TIMOTHY SILVA'S conduct in sexually abusing Plaintiffs and others.
- 73. As a legal result of Defendants' conduct as described hereinabove, Plaintiffs have suffered, and will continue to suffer great pain of mind, body, shock, emotional distress, physical manifestations of emotional distress, embarrassment, loss of self-esteem, disgrace, humiliation, and loss of enjoyment of life. Further, Plaintiffs were prevented and will continue to be prevented from performing daily activities and obtaining the full enjoyment of life. Each Plaintiff has sustained loss of earnings and earning capacity. Each Plaintiff has incurred and will incur expenses for medical and psychological treatment, therapy, and counseling.

///// /////

NINTH CAUSE OF ACTION
ALTER EGO AND SINGLE BUSINESS ENTERPRISE

- 74. Plaintiffs incorporate herein by this reference and re-allege paragraphs 1 through 73 of this Complaint as if fully set forth herein.
- 75. Plaintiffs allege that the WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS are organized and controlled and their affairs are so conducted that they are in fact mere instrumentalities and alter egos for each other and liable for each other's acts. Alternatively, the WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS were all engaged, at all times hereinabove mentioned, in a single business enterprise and are liable for each other's acts.
- As a legal result of Defendants' conduct as described hereinabove, Plaintiffs have suffered, and will continue to suffer great pain of mind, body, shock, emotional distress, physical manifestations of emotional distress, embarrassment, loss of self-esteem, disgrace, humiliation, and loss of enjoyment of life. Further, Plaintiffs were prevented and will continue to be prevented from performing daily activities and obtaining the full enjoyment of life. Each Plaintiff has sustained loss of earnings and earning capacity. Each Plaintiff has incurred and will incur expenses for medical and psychological treatment, therapy, and counseling.

TENTH CAUSE OF ACTION NEGLIGENT USURPATION OF INVESTIGATORY FUNCTION

- 77. Plaintiffs incorporate herein by this reference and re-allege paragraphs 1 through 76 of this Complaint as if fully set forth herein.
- 78. Plaintiffs allege that California Penal Code Section 11164, *et. seq.*, (and predecessor provisions) requires officials to perform specific responsibilities to carry out the policy of said statutes. The WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS assumed these duties and responsibilities, but negligently failed to perform them.
- 79. As a legal result of Defendants' conduct as described hereinabove, Plaintiffs have suffered, and will continue to suffer great pain of mind, body, shock, emotional distress, physical manifestations of emotional distress, embarrassment, loss of self-esteem, disgrace, humiliation, and loss of enjoyment of life. Further, Plaintiffs were prevented and will continue to be prevented from performing daily activities and obtaining the full enjoyment of life. Each Plaintiff has sustained loss

of earnings and earning capacity. Each Plaintiff has incurred and will incur expenses for medical and psychological treatment, therapy, and counseling.

ELEVENTH CAUSE OF ACTION VIOLATION OF CALIFORNIA PENAL CODE SECTION 182

- 80. Plaintiffs incorporate herein by this reference and re-allege paragraphs 1 through 79 of this Complaint as if fully set forth herein.
- 81. Plaintiffs allege the WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS' acts described herein violate California Penal Code Section 182 in that the WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS conspired with one or more other persons to commit acts injurious to the public health, to public morals, or to pervert or obstruct justice, or the due administration of the laws.
- 82. As a legal result of Defendants' conduct as described hereinabove, Plaintiffs have suffered, and will continue to suffer great pain of mind, body, shock, emotional distress, physical manifestations of emotional distress, embarrassment, loss of self-esteem, disgrace, humiliation, and loss of enjoyment of life. Further, Plaintiffs were prevented and will continue to be prevented from performing daily activities and obtaining the full enjoyment of life. Each Plaintiff has sustained loss of earnings and earning capacity. Each Plaintiff has incurred and will incur expenses for medical and psychological treatment, therapy, and counseling.

TWELFTH CAUSE OF ACTION VIOLATION OF CALIFORNIA PENAL CODE SECTION 32

- 83. Plaintiffs incorporate herein by this reference and re-allege paragraphs 1 through 82 of this Complaint as if fully set forth herein.
- 84. Plaintiffs allege the WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS' acts described herein violate California Penal Code Section 32 in that the WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS harbored, concealed and/or aided their agent, Defendant TIMOTHY SILVA, had committed a felony, with the intent that their agent, Defendant TIMOTHY SILVA, might avoid or escape arrest, trial, conviction and/or punishment, and the WATCHTOWER DEFENDANTS having knowledge that their agent, Defendant TIMOTHY SILVA had committed a felony.